

March 1, 2011

Volume 3, Issue 1

ISSN 2155-5478

# Caucasus Edition

## Journal of Conflict Transformation

### *In this issue:*

#### **Analysis:**

**Side effects of conflict: the impact on education system in Azerbaijan**

By *Hashim Gafarov*

**Gender asymmetry (Androcentrism) in Karabakhi Armenian dialect: the power of nomination**

By *Nona Shahnazarian*

#### **News Digest:**

**Digest of Armenian Media for Feb 14- 28, 2011**

By *News Digest*

**Digest of Azerbaijani Media for Feb 15- 26, 2011**

By *News Digest*

#### **The Neutral Zone**

Read more at: [www.caucasusedition.net](http://www.caucasusedition.net) Follow us on [Facebook](#) and [Twitter](#)

#### **Side effects of conflict: the impact on education system in Azerbaijan**

By *Hashim Gafarov*

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, all fifteen republics that were once part of one of the two superpowers became third-rank developing countries. All the hardships of being a third-world country were at least doubled by being a country in transition, meaning a transition mainly from a central economy to a free-market economy. Obviously, this transition affected all sectors of public life. Perhaps the region most affected by this new reality was the Caucasus, mainly due to numerous devastating ethnic conflicts. The first years of much rejoiced independence was marred by these conflicts, which did nothing but collapse already shattered states... **Read more on Page 3**

#### **News Digest**

##### **Digest of Armenian Media for Feb 14- 28, 2011**

By *News Digest*

02.14.2011Tert.am **Nalbandyan and Karasin discussed Karabakh conflict** According to the article, Armenian Foreign Minsiter Edward Nalbandyan discussed issues related to the resolution of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict with the Deputy Russian Foreign Minsiter Grigori Karasin at a meeting in Yerevan. It also says that the two diplomats reviewed the implementation of recent agreements reached by Yerevan and Moscow, one of which, signed during Russian President Dmitry Medvedev's August 2010 visit to Armenia, is meant to deepen the already close military ties between the two nations... **Read more on Page 12**

#### **Gender asymmetry (Androcentrism) in Karabakhi Armenian dialect: the power of nomination**

By *Nona Shahnazarian*

The mental regulation of gender reality is also realized by verbal means through language categories shaping gender identity. In this paper an attempt will be made to reveal the extent to which the Karabakh dialect of the Armenian language is inclined towards masculinization and androcentrism. How are gender stereotypes constructed and reproduced in the culture of Karabakh Armenians through linguistic practices? I will try to illustrate that the Karabakh dialect (as in classic Armenian and many other world languages) reflects the relationship of dominance and subordination... **Read more on Page 7**

##### **Digest of Azerbaijani Media for Feb 15- 26, 2011**

By *News Digest*

15.02.2011TRENDAZ **Separatist regime confirms fact of large-scale military exercises in Azerbaijan's occupied territories** [ENG] The newspaper reports on the confirmation of large-scale military exercise carried out in the occupied Azerbaijani territories by the separatist regime of Nagorno-Karabakh. According to the reports, exercises would last till February 19<sup>th</sup>... **Read more on Page 23**

## **The Neutral Zone**

### **Migration in Armenia in perspective**

*By Erik Grigoryan*

Large scale uncontrolled emigration is a major threat to national security and development of the republic of Armenia. Yet, the state structures, statistical services and the research community have not yet succeeded in properly studying this matter, providing correct statistical and intellectual data and policy recommendations. With the demise of the Soviet Union and in result of political situations, disasters and conflicts, Armenia saw a population movement of massive scales... **To read more please proceed to the site.**

### **Getting divorce in Azerbaijan**

*By Lala Jumayeva*

I do not believe it is possible to find many people who get married just to get a divorce. Usually people get married with an aim to have their own family, i.e. children and spouse that they choose and with whom they want to share the rest of their lives with (I would stress here that not everyone is lucky enough to choose his/her own partner but this is a topic for another post)... **To read more place proceed to the site.**

### **Divorce! Is it the end of life for Armenian women or the beginning**

*By Anna Poghosyan*

What does it mean to give someone a promise of love when you utter the following words? “ I offer you my solemn vow to be your faithful partner in sickness and in health, for richer and for poorer, to love and to cherish, till death us do part...”

It literally means that you are promising to live your whole life with a person whom you say “Yes” to that moment... **To read more please proceed to the site.**

## **ANALYSIS**

### **Side effects of conflict: the impact on education system in Azerbaijan**

*By Hashim Gafarov*

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, all fifteen republics that were once part of one of the two superpowers became third-rank developing countries. All the hardships of being a third-world country were at least doubled by being a country in transition, meaning a transition mainly from a central economy to a free-market economy. Obviously, this transition affected all sectors of public life.

Perhaps the region most affected by this new reality was the Caucasus, mainly due to numerous devastating ethnic conflicts. The first years of much rejoiced independence was marred by these conflicts, which did nothing but collapse already shattered states. This collapse started from the economy, but soon covered all other institutions of these newborn states including the moral and belief system. In a very short period, all citizens were told that the once unquestionable communist system was, after all, wrong, and different beliefs started to fill this vacuum. The lion's share went to nationalism. The much acclaimed "Soviet brotherhood" ended up in most cases with hatred or at least with suspicion. This was more evident in the Caucasus, the region called the "museum of nations" because of its ethnic diversity. The once multiethnic states of the Caucasus became dominant by one ethnic group because of ethnic cleansing.

All these developments had an enormous impact on the educational system and the youth of these countries in general. As the transition for older generations was difficult and in most cases impossible, a big gap was opened between parents and their respective children. There were big communication problems even among different age groups of the young generation itself. The scale of changes was so huge that even a few years of difference in age had an immeasurable impact on people's behavior.

In the case of Azerbaijan, as the ethnic conflict with Armenia preceded the independence of the country by a couple of years, ethnic nationalism became the dominant power once the country became independent in 1991. Huge popular demonstrations covered the whole country and the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict became the agenda of the day, in such a scale that all other problems were totally undermined. All successive governments were too busy with the war, and little or no attention was given to the other numerous social problems.

However, some changes were made in the educational system when a new testing system was introduced for entrance into the universities. This move was a big step as it created a fair opportunity for all students to get into any university and faculty based on their knowledge. The previous system was famous for its high level of corruption, as some privileged students could study in certain faculties, such as law. Unfortunately, during the last five to six years the corruption became evident even in this new system, though far less than the previous one.

Indeed, the relatively high level of education was one of the most important advantages that Azerbaijan and other post-soviet countries inherited from the USSR. Now the literacy level in the country is 98% of the whole population, which is very high especially when compared to other Muslim countries.<sup>[1]</sup> According to UNICEF (2007), 99% of men and 96% of women are literate (p. 6). But after independence, the quality of education worsened due to various reasons. The first was corruption, as it became an open business between students and teachers as they started "trading" certain marks for certain prices. Some teachers go so far by declaring openly that there is no way to pass the exam except by giving bribes. The amount of the bribe changes according to the importance of the subject and the academic-administrative position of the teacher. This amount also fluctuates from one university to another. For example, it is significantly cheaper to pass an exam at the Azerbaijan State University of Architecture and Construction than at Baku State University (especially when it comes to prestigious faculties such as Law and International Relations).

The content of education was and still is another big problem facing students in most of the former Soviet Republics. During the 1990s, students at Baku State University still had to pass an exam in the history of the USSR and the Communist Party. According to Suleymanov (1996):

All the books were very outdated, most of the heroes had turned traitors and vice versa, but the test was still there and had to be passed. The solution was easy: lecture time was spent chatting, and the grades were based on attendance. Later in 1992, the contrast was even more pronounced with one professor teaching the virtues of a free market economy and another one demanding that students memorize Lenin's works of collectivization. (pp. 10–11)

Gradually, nationalism filled the major vacuum across all subjects.

### **Lack of literature and broken system**

The availability of books and other educational materials is still a big problem. Because of the language barrier, books in English or other Western languages stay inaccessible for a majority of students, though the trend among students to learn English is very high. A good amount of books can be found in a few book stores in Baku, mainly in Russian. Those books are mainly translated from other languages in different subjects. However, the number of buyers is not big enough to make this an attractable business. The number of book readers declined sharply after the collapse of the Soviet Union and has not yet recovered. It is worth noting that the Soviet Union was among the first states in the world for the numbers of books read. There are two major reasons for this decline. First of all, the whole situation in the republic was so hard that an ordinary citizen had no time or even money to afford to buy and read a book. The fact that the whole belief system collapsed overnight was also an important factor, shattering the belief of the people in anything else. The second factor, as mentioned above, is the lack of materials in the Azerbaijani language. Books in foreign languages, even in Russian, remain inaccessible for the majority of the population.

However, as the trend for learning foreign languages is very high amongst the youth, this generation is often better trained to read from different sources in at least one foreign language (which is mainly English) than older generation, which happens to be their teachers. The majority of teachers, especially at the university level, is of the old generation, trained during the Soviet period and lacking any knowledge other than outdated Soviet literature. It is not surprising to meet teachers who still talk about the "bright future of communism." Since there is no option to choose or drop a course, as is the case in Western educational systems, students end up sitting and listening to outdated lectures, and then have to pass an irrelevant exam.

Some representatives of the younger generation who studied in Western countries currently teach at university level. However, in most cases they are overwhelmed by workloads and are often marginalized, especially at public universities. The deans are not selected but appointed, and not for their educational credentials, but for their loyalty to the corrupt system of which they themselves are ardent representatives. Even the student unions should be loyal to this system, thus instead of representing the students, they become the representatives of this corrupt system.

### **Private Universities**

Another interesting case is the private universities. Shortly after independence, numerous private universities came into existence. However, most of them were later shut down, mainly because of their lack of infrastructure for giving appropriate education. That problem was and is one of the main reasons for a lack of confidence amongst the public for private universities, though in some cases their level of education is better than in public universities. The other reason is that the employers were reluctant to hire the graduates of private universities, which started to change during the last several years. Among the universities that still operate, some of them are known for a poor level of education and high level of corruption (such as International University of Azerbaijan, which is in the process of being shut down), but others offer a relatively good quality of education and no corruption (such as Qafqaz and Khazar University).

However, there are numerous problems that private universities face. First of all, because of the lack of confidence in these universities, the bright students choose public universities, and thus students with a poor level of knowledge end up going to private universities, in most cases because of lack of choice. Second, there is a huge lack of qualified lecturers. As private universities are the main crusaders of modernization, their main challenge is to hire professionals with Western education. But because of low salary levels, the graduates of Western universities prefer to work in private companies (such as the oil sector) for relatively higher salaries. Those who choose to teach at universities do so only part time only a few hours per month, and in most cases they also lack professionalism, as most of them do not have a PhD or adequate teaching level. The third problem is the struggle to survive in an unfair system. After more and more private universities were shut down, the others were trying to be more compliant with government authorities. Recently, the faculties of law, international relations, international law, medicine, and biology of all private universities were closed, thus depriving them of crucial financial income, as those faculties are more in demand and thus more expensive. The universities had no other choice but to comply.

### **Education abroad**

The students who studied in Western universities are often considered the best hope for Azerbaijan's future, as they bring the most updated know-how back to their countries. Such a study was even unthinkable before independence. The most prestigious universities were those in Moscow. Though even today a huge number of students study in Russia, Ukraine, and other post-Soviet countries, the first choice is Western universities. However, after independence, only a few people had a chance to study in the West, mostly thanks to scholarships given by international organizations or foreign embassies operating in Baku. The demand was far more than the offer, which made it very difficult to get such scholarships for the majority of students. The scholarships were mainly given by the Turkish, American and French embassies, British Council, German DAAD, and Open Society Institute.

On April 16, 2007, Azerbaijani president Ilham Aliyev issued a decree "On ratification of State program on education of Azerbaijani youth abroad for the years 2007–2015." According to the document, funding for this program should be realized by the State Oil Fund of the Republic of Azerbaijan. This program envisages the education of more than five thousand Azerbaijani students abroad (UNICEF, p. 12). But from the first year, the implementation of the program was characterized by unprofessionalism and chaos. The students accepted to foreign universities could not get scholarships because of sometimes ridiculous excuses, such as "the person who takes care of distributing scholarships is on vacation." There were other cases when students did not get scholarships because of their active role in society and even their criticism of the government.

As for the students who got a chance to study in Western universities, they used these opportunities in different ways. Some of them studied hard, learned what they could, and then returned to Azerbaijan and actively joined social life. Others preferred to stay in the countries they went to, which was a loss for Azerbaijan as they were mainly the brightest minds as we mentioned above. There are many reasons why they could choose not to return—economic, political, among others. Some refused to come back because they saw no decent job opportunities, some thought that there was no political and economic freedom for them to act, while others thought it is economically more beneficial to stay and work in Western countries. Thus, some diaspora-based organizations were created by Azerbaijani students or alumni mainly within nationalistic frames (which is characteristic of any diaspora-based organization).

It should also be mentioned that a good part of those students neglected their studies for various reasons. It is difficult to name one, because most of the time there were a combination of reasons. The result was that many students returned home without any diploma. The interesting fact is that even such students were welcomed back home, as the simple truth that they came from a Western country was important enough and in fact, no one checked or asked if they passed their exams and earned their diplomas. Among those students, the ones who went at their own expense (i.e., with their families' financial support) are most likely to fail, because mainly they used to study (or rather not study, thanks to corruption) back home and were not able to do so abroad. In one recent case, an Azerbaijani student at the University of York in the United Kingdom bribed the former head of European equity derivatives trading at Credit Suisse, in order to help him to cheat his way through his final-year economics exams (Hodgson, 2008).

However, Azerbaijan is not a net exporter of students. In the 2006/2007 academic year, 5,316 student from 50 different countries chose to study in Azerbaijan, an all-time high number. According to UNICEF, “Students from Turkey, Iran, China, India, Bangladesh, as well as students from Arabian states study mainly for profession of ‘oil engineering’, ‘electro mechanics’, ‘geodesy’, ‘construction engineering’, ‘physics’, ‘international relations’, ‘economics’, ‘medicine’ and ‘art’. It should be noted that, 95 % of foreign students study at paid basis” (p. 12). In addition to tuition fees, they also, in most cases, have to pay bribes in order to be successful. It is well known that most of the Turkish students go to Azerbaijan just because it is “easy” to study there.

## Conclusion

As the whole education system was left broken after the collapse of the Soviet Union and its official communist ideology, the vacuum was mainly filled by newborn nationalism. The main reason was the war over Nagorno-Karabakh. Any professor, even an old communist supporter, could gain popularity by being an ardent nationalist, which was/is equal to being anti-Armenian. Be it a private or public university, be it a student who studied only at home or abroad, be it a professor from ruling party or opposition—they all shared the same narrative: nationalism. This was not unique to Azerbaijan. We could observe this phenomenon all over the world: a good Canadian is anti-American, a good Pakistani is anti-Indian, a good Abkhaz is anti-Georgian, and obviously a patriotic Armenian is anti-Azeri.

Thanks to national media and other forms of mass narratives, whole nations are usually generalized as good or bad, and one is often unwillingly forced to take sides. The educational system is a crucial part of this destructive machine. It is also an old one that old elites in Europe used for state-building purposes following the Great French Revolution. Unfortunately, we are still locked in those narratives, and unless we are willing to liberate our educational and other state institutions we will continue being the slaves of our own imagination, which has often nothing to do with reality.

## References

- Hodgson, M. (2008, January 22). City Banker, 34, sat exams for student, 22. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2008/jan/22/highereducation.students>
- Suleymanov, E. (1996). Youth in search of the future: Identity changes in post-soviet Azerbaijan. *Azerbaijan International*, 4(4), 10–11.
- UNICEF. (2007). *The State of Youth in Azerbaijan: Summary of Analytical Report*. Baku: Zulfugarov, Nagiyeva, Efendiyev, Abbasali, & Sadigzade.

# Gender Asymmetry (Androcentrism) in Karabakhi Armenian Dialect: the Power of Nomination

By Nona Shahnazarian

The mental regulation of gender reality is also realized by verbal means through language categories shaping gender identity. In this paper an attempt will be made to reveal the extent to which the Karabakh dialect of the Armenian language is inclined towards masculinization and androcentrism. How are gender stereotypes constructed and reproduced in the culture of Karabakh Armenians through linguistic practices? I will try to illustrate that the Karabakh dialect (as in classic Armenian and many other world languages) reflects the relationship of dominance and subordination.

There is an opinion that the social world can exist only as a nominal one, in other words as something defined by language categories. Therefore, manifestations that are defined as “dominance” and “subordination” are inalienable from those categories in which they are described and perceived. Perceptions of “dominance” and “subordination” shape and legitimize human behavior. Eventually, reality and life are regulated in the minds of people based on those perceptions. On the given background the question of the power of nomination happens to be most essential. The one who has the right to nominate exercises power, calling the nominated phenomena to life through nomination itself.<sup>[i]</sup> In the case in question, the entire society from top to bottom and on levels is involved in the social act.

In a number of scientific papers by specialists in gender linguistics, the focus is on the correlation of the meanings of the words “person/human being” and “woman,” “person/human being,” and “man.”<sup>[ii]</sup> Supposedly, the words “human being/person” and “man” are quasi-synonymous by default. However, as admitted by many specialists, “in different languages this type of a semantic parallelism is expressed at different levels of intensity.”<sup>[iii]</sup> As in many other languages, in the Karabakh dialect the fact of the woman’s exclusion from the society is expressed through the equivalency of the words “human being” and “man,” as they are identical (transliterated as *mard*). In this dialect, there also exists a separate word, which serves to signify the category of the “human being” without gender specification (i.e., *juvar*). Scholars trace this word to different etymology. According to A. Mkrtychyan, it literally means “master/manager of water.” However, despite the neutral sense of the word that occurs nowadays, *juvars* that used to manage the distribution of water resources in Karabakhi villages were exclusively men, who stood out as being honest, kind, compassionate, and fair (interview with L. Harutyunyan). “... based on its economic activities the community would choose the persons that would manage water resources based on their personal qualities.”<sup>[iv]</sup> Therefore this neutrality is dual in its character.<sup>[v]</sup>

The abundance of similar examples expressively demonstrates that language norms comprise the masculine power setup. The identification of the masculine and human that is typical for many cultures is based on the dichotomy of mentality that opposes culture to nature, active to passive, rational to irrational, masculine to feminine.

The deeply rooted attitude in Karabakhi Armenian tradition towards a woman (girl, young girl) as being someone “temporary” in the ancestral home (it is verbalized through the metaphor “the candle of an alien family hearth,” where “hearth” stands for “home,” or “the charred log of an alien family hearth”), as well as to someone “alien” (in indirect speech sometimes she is called that way) in her husband’s home, condemns women to eternal marginalization.

Social insignificance of the woman (daughter), her marginal status within the society as opposed to the glorification and exaltation of men (son), is distinctly illustrated in lullabies. It is expressed through separation of texts for girls and boys.

Below is a common lullaby for girls, transliterated from the Karabakhi dialect:

*Axč'ik onim, saz axč'ikä*

*Aškerð čal-čal axčikā*

*Pürt'ð perek' pežink' kapim*

*Ofterð pernink' tanink'*

The same lullaby translated into English:

I have a daughter; she is the real goods,

She is bright-eyed,

Fetch me some fleece, I will prepare her dowry,

We shall load it on camels and take it away.

Once again, we come across the connotation of the temporality, which is highlighted from cradle and throughout the life of the girl in the ancestral home. Hopes and expectations from a boy, a son, are totally different. Lullabies for boys express the traditional attitude towards a boy as of one who is the successor and who is to continue the family, the heir, the master. This can probably be traced back to those times when in terms of providing the family with all the necessary things for living, the activities performed by men were of far more significance than that of women. Economic prosperity and the prestige of the family and the clan depended solely on the activities performed by men and their status.

The subordinate and auxiliary position of women is reflected in a great number of metaphors and associations. "A family is like a millstone, the woman is the bottom stone and the man the top stone." *ðntanik'ð – arkank'a: kðnegð – tðkak'arna, mardð – eřak'arð*" (interview with L. Harutyunyan, village Ashan). However, some of the metaphors and proverbs also contain the realization of the complementarity of the roles and functions of men and women.

The language also explicitly fixes the difference between the statuses of younger girls (positive characteristics) and of women (more negative). There are no bad girls, yet there are no good women (wives). *Več pis axč'ik tēsenk', več' l'av kðneg*. The next proverb reflects the attitude towards marriage as of a transition into a different state and the necessity to utterly adjust to new conditions and rules of the new family – "As you get married, you change the shirt you wear next to your skin/ undershirt." (*Mart'uvðs k'in'um – halavðt p'oxumðs*). Here again we witness the connotation of an unconditional shift in the identity and a complete loss of touch with the initial family.

One of the classic examples of gender dichotomy is the accepted phrasing that is used to denote a bachelor (*āzāp'*) and a woman that is late with getting married, "an old maid" (*tanð mnac'ac*) – literally, 'the one who remained in the home', that in its nature is explicitly valuating. The first, "male" characteristic is positive, and the "female" characteristic presupposes that there exists an anomaly in the situation, implying that in collective consciousness it is the man that decides to refuse the burden of the bonds of wedlock, whereas with women it is a matter of being outside the choice zone.

Behind the militaristic and heroic rhetoric of the last decade a great deal of attention has been paid to emphasizing such qualities in people as courage and valor. In praising women that have these qualities they are often called *tłamard-kðneg'*, which literally means "a man-woman." In a similar situation, when this concerns a courageous man, a tautology *tłamard-tła* – "man-man," which comes to mean "real man" both biologically and spiritually, is used. This type of denotation marks the rooted opinion that courage and valor by their nature are exclusively masculine.

The brightest and most positive characteristics of a woman are "she is not a woman, but a sea" (*Kðneg č'i – cov a*). All the pathos of the sacrificial, tolerant, and obedient nature of a woman, which again is there to serve the man, family, and clan, is concentrated in this proverb. There are other positive

characteristics of a woman, which again reflect all the depth of the man-woman hierarchy: a strongly canonized woman that meets all the commonly circulating perceptions is called *kadriēl kâneg* (the existence of the concept itself is of great significance). There is also another word that reflects the same meaning – *nâstâc'ârac kâneg* (literally, a woman put down, pacified, tamed, and adjusted to all existing criteria). Usually, this refers to women that have an absolute sense of their place, with a distinct, precise, and subtle realization of the “position that she occupies within the social structure.”<sup>[vi]</sup>

It is typical that more often than not women themselves are the channels of these ideas taking an active part in the generation of an andocentric discourse and the retranslation of the phallogocentric way of thinking of the younger generation, thus in fact, shaping public conscience. At the same time, the fact that women very often use “male” language is not surprising: in a number of spheres simply no other language exists, therefore no choice. In indirect speech a woman calls her husband the “master” (*tar*). In many villages, a widow is still referred to as a “headless woman” (*anklox kyneg*). According to discourse a young girl is of no significance as an individual, but is attached to her family name, clan, and father, and very often marriage strategies strongly depend on these categories.

In their discourse women say, “If the husband (man) says to his wife (woman) that the yogurt is black, she must agree that it is black.” (*Mardâ ver asuma macunâ seva, kânegâ bidi vâzyav one ver tiya*). “A woman without a husband is like a dog without a master.” (*Anmard kânegâ hanc'a andar šon âni*).

For domestic violence, compelling justifications are made, like “if he beats, it means that he loves” and “he beats because he is the man, that is the order of things.” “*there was this woman in our village called Mina from the neighboring village Pirgjamal. Her husband was a frail, undersized man called Atun, that was nicknamed Papachist (a small bird). He would beat her black and blue. At the same time, she was a woman of an astonishing strength... the fellow villagers would keep asking her: “why do you tolerate all this beating up, for you to beat him down is as easy as it can be?” in response she kept repeating “that is the way things are established, the husband is the one who beats up his wife, and I was born a woman” (Ădât'na – mardâ kânganâ kât'akē, de es ēl' kânegum cânval)*.”<sup>[vii]</sup>

An authentic mourning song sung by the mother at the grave of her son goes “my dear son, didn't I tell you not to marry L., she doesn't have brothers, and you will have no one to back you up when hard times come. My unfortunate, miserable son you condemned yourself to loneliness by marrying her. If you had a brother in law, you would have someone to rely on. And now that you are gone, he would take care of your children...” However, in the given case it is the discourse of survival that is revealed more distinctly, rather than the actualization of the gender-based dominance-subordination. And this might be a new angle in studying language practices. Meanwhile, there is a presupposition that only a man (the brother) can back up the family and help them out, as he is “free,” which means he is active, and not a woman (the sister) as she already belongs to a different home and is “not free,” therefore is passive.

However, in contemporary post-war society where life brings forth new perspectives and values, a different gender standard is gradually called for, which will have the capacity of realizing the peculiarities and values of both genders. This process, as all other similar processes that are related to public consciousness, is long going and quite controversial by nature, which always comes across resistance to innovations. The war in which women demonstrated self-forgetful inspiration and valor, played the role of a catalyst for these transformations. Television through the transmission of values of western culture also has had its impact. The promotion of these priorities leads to the establishment of new gender paradigms, which appreciate intellect, competency, high working capacities, purposefulness, and consistency irrespective of the gender.

## Conclusion

The result of the current analysis that describes the mechanisms of impacting on the “language-power” level, through commonplace discourses and folklore texts, is that language functions (and more broadly discourse functions) as tools for exercising power are revealed. These language games are more transparent in traditional societies, an illustrative example of which is Karabakhi Armenian society. The examples cited in this paper reflect the connection between the discourse and ideology of androcracy, the power of men. Hidden and explicit connotations that are perceived by public consciousness as a given tell

us about the extreme polarization of that consciousness. At the same time, the recent events (and the discourses on the discussion of those events) reveal weak manifestations of alternative language practices that assess people irrespective of their gender. Meanwhile, the resistance of society is enormous.

It seems that traces of gender transformations of the last twenty years can be described only by means of voicing the stories of silent, mute groups, like women. Throughout a troublesome period of change, the social field of Karabakhi Armenian culture that is under consideration revealed itself in at least two different states: in the comparatively stable period and extreme realities of wartime. These conditions beyond any doubt have to a certain extent modified the discourse itself, which at the same time depends on the specific stance of every individual/author in his respective community. By saying this we mean that a cultural anthropologist “has to” take into consideration the “objective” character of the initial position. Sex/gender, background, neighborhood, bringing up, and personal stories of different people – all these factors define the vectors of possible life strategies. People move within this field, developing or reproducing their own discourses both on regular basis and as the field is “breaking down.” But they do this in spite of themselves. However, there is an “ideal” model, the rules for which most of the time exist as declarative preferences, but when tested strongly contradict the reality.

Upon concluding the analysis of discourses and the variety of female statuses in Karabakhi Armenian society, a contradiction is revealed: despite the fact that in the new social context women have significantly moved to the frontline both in military and economic spheres, the ideology on all significant levels continues to serve the needs of the power of men, filling in the entire semantic space of Karabakhi Armenian culture. On the level of commonplace consciousness the dominance of men continues to be perceived as natural, and the self-actualization of women, on the contrary, is perceived as unnatural, extreme, and accidental. Women’s vision of life, which is realized through the light of masculine values, hinders the establishment process of a more or less sound women’s movement for egalitarianism.

*The full version of the article was published in Russian under the title: Language as the Marker of Correlation of Dominance and Subordination (Gender Aspect) in Bulletin: Anthropology, minorities, multiculturalism, No. 4, pp. 84-96. Krasnodar, 2003.*

#### References

- [i] *Pierre Bourdieu*. The Social Space and the Genesis of Groups. *Theory and Society*, Vol. 14, No. 6 (Nov., 1985), pp. 723-744. Springer.
- [ii] See.: *Городникова М.Д.* Гендерный аспект обращений как фактор речевого регулирования. Гендерный аспект перевода // Гендер как интрига познания. Сб. ст. М.: “Рудомино” 2000.
- Лакофф Р.* Язык и место женщины // Введение в гендерные исследования. Хрестоматия. Ч.2. Алетейя. Харьков, СПб. 2001; *Попов А.А.* Об учете гендерного аспекта в лексикографическом кодировании // Гендер как интрига познания. Сб. ст. М.: “Рудомино” 2000; *Потапов В.В.* Попытки пересмотра гендерного признака в английском языке // Гендер как интрига познания. Сб. ст. М.: “Рудомино” 2000; *Спендер Д.* Мужчина создал язык // Введение в гендерные исследования. Хрестоматия. Ч.2. Харьков, СПб.: Алетейя. 2001; *Халеева И.И.* Гендер как интрига познания // Гендер как интрига познания. Сб. ст. Изд. “Рудомино” М, 2000.
- [iii] *Weiss D.* Kurica ne ptiza, (a) baba ne celovek // *Slavische Linguistik*. 1987. S. 413-443.
- [iv] *Мкртчян А.* Общественный быт армян Нагорного Карабаха (вторая половина 19 – начало 20 вв.) Автореферат диссертации на соискание ученой степени кандидата исторических наук. Ереван. 1988. С. 13.
- [v] Polish linguist and an expert in Armenian studies professor A. Pisovich gives a different meaning to this word, assuming that it stems from Persian. The Armenian-Karabakh word *juvar* comes from the Persian *janvar* (with a long first “a”); in colloquial Persian *junvar* means “an animal” (literally “animate”), where *jan* stands for “spirit,” and *var* initially was a suffix that denoted an attribute. A “resonant” beginning (in Karabakh Armenian dialect for most every cases the letter J is rarely used) attests to the fact that the word is borrowed. Later A. Pisovich expressed serious doubts with respect to the semantic aspect, as it was difficult to believe that a human being was identified with an animal. He suggested that probably within the context (distributing water) there might be another fitting etymology, i.e., “*ju(y)*’ means a brook, a stream, irrigation ditch, a channel, stream bed” (словарь Рубинчика, том 1, стр. 447, 1970 г.). the compound word (which cannot be found in dictionaries but is possible theoretically) “*juy-avar*” could mean “the one who channels an irrigation ditch.”

[vi] *Pierre Bourdieu*. The Social Space and the Genesis of Groups. *Theory and Society*, Vol. 14, No. 6 (Nov., 1985), pp. 723-744. Springer.

[vii] Interview by the author.

## **NEWS DIGEST**

### **Digest of Armenian Media for Feb 14- 28, 2011**

*By News Digest*

02.14.2011

Tert.am

#### **Nalbandyan and Karasin discussed Karabakh conflict**(ENG)

According to the article, Armenian Foreign Minister Edward Nalbandyan discussed issues related to the resolution of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict with the Deputy Russian Foreign Minister Grigori Karasin at a meeting in Yerevan. It also says that the two diplomats reviewed the implementation of recent agreements reached by Yerevan and Moscow, one of which, signed during Russian President Dmitry Medvedev's August 2010 visit to Armenia, is meant to deepen the already close military ties between the two nations.

02.15.2011

Tert.am

#### **New war in Karabakh to jeopardize Russian-Turkish ties– Ankara issues warning** (ENG)

The article says that the Director of the Turkish National Intelligence Organization (MIT) Hakan Fidan held a meeting with the Azerbaijani president Ilham Aliyev and national security minister, Eldar Mahmudov and discussed the Nagorno Karabakh issue among other things. Citing unnamed sources Turkish newspaper Takvim, however, writes that Fidan conveyed the message of Turkey's president and prime minister to Ilham Aliyev.

"Fidan said at the meetings that an Armenian-Azerbaijani war may pose threat to the energy carriers extending across the region, as well as jeopardize the Russian-Turkish cooperation which is of key importance for the region," the paper quoted the source as saying.

#### **OSCE Minsk Group has realized it should take small but real steps, analyst**

Political analyst Gagik Harutyunyan said that the OSCE Minsk Group has realized that it should take small but real steps. "I think that the Minsk group has realized that it should take small but real steps. The Minsk Group seems to have realized that wrong is the process, according to which the Madrid Principles are perceived in Azerbaijan that our liberated territories are being given to them, while they can further decide whether or not give Karabakh self-determination.

Lragir.am

#### **NATO won't participate in Karabakh settlement** (ARM)

According to the article, James Appathurai, the Special Representative for the Caucasus and Central Asia of NATO's Secretary General, said that the organization does not consider its involvement in the settlement of the Karabakh conflict. According to him, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization does not see its role in the resolution in the Karabakh conflict, though it is concerned about the current peace process between Armenia and Azerbaijan.

### [Naira Zohrabyan sent letter to French Co-Chair Fassier](#) (ARM)

Naira Zohrabyan, a member of the Armenian delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, sent a letter to the OSCE French Co-Chair Bernard Fassier. In the letter, she referred to the re-launching of the PACE subcommittee on Karabakh, adding that the OSCE co-chairs themselves have for several times made it clear that any format for the settlement of the Karabakh conflict other than the OSCE is simply unacceptable. Further, she said that the previous sub-committee on Karabakh proved that it could not do anything effective. She also called on Fassier to come up with explanations as to why France's representative at the PACE Bureau did not support OSCE's viewpoints over Karabakh.

"Dear co-chair, these are issues in need of clear explanation," read the letter.

02.15.2011

News.am

### [Steady progress in Nagorno-Karabakh conflict resolution, expert says](#)

Head of Noravank foundation Gagik Harutyunyan said that a small-but-concrete-steps approach is being applied to the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict resolution. According to him, along with its omissions the OSCE Minsk Group is the most effective body in resolving the Karabakh conflict at the moment. The sides reached an agreement on the exchange of war prisoners and dead bodies. Later, talks on withdrawal of snipers are likely to be conducted, he noted.

02.16.2011

Tert.am

### [Armenia is not taking advantage of Azerbaijan's mistakes over Karabakh – analyst](#) (ENG)

According to this article, political analyst David Shahnazaryan said that Armenia is not taking advantage of the mistakes Azerbaijan is making when it comes to the settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. He also said that the peace talks over Nagorno Karabakh are not taking place within the OSCE Minsk Group, as it is generally said, but rather within the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, the UN Security Council and other international arenas.

"The Azerbaijani authorities have made numerous mistakes, proving that the negotiation process is simply a matter of territorial integrity for them, and they have put themselves in an extremely serious situation by constantly speaking about the military resolution of the [Karabakh] conflict," said he.

### [Growing tensions over Karabakh are worrisome – OSCE Chairman-in-Office](#) (ENG)

Speaking about the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict at UN Security Council meeting, the OSCE Chairman-in-Office and Lithuanian Foreign Minister Audronius Azubalis that the growing tensions on the ground over Nagorno-Karabakh are worrisome. "The OSCE role in pursuing a settlement of this prolonged conflict through greater engagement by the co-chairs of the Minsk Group will be maintained. I will invite the conflict parties to implement confidence-building measures, including immediate withdrawal of snipers from the Line of Contact, and strengthening OSCE monitoring activities," said he.

### [Preservation of status quo in Karabakh is beneficial for Iran](#) (ARM)

According to the article, specialist of Iranian Studies, Mher Baghdasaryan, said that Iran is at least the only country in the region for which the preservation of the status quo in Nagorno Karabakh is beneficial. In his words, Iran sees Azerbaijan as a competitor in the region, besides, Baku also has territorial claims towards

Tehran therefore it is natural that the preservation of the current status of Nagorno Karabakh and its independence in the future is beneficial for Iran.

“Declaration of Artsakh’s Recognition means the defeat of the entire Azerbaijan diplomacy which can result even in revolution,” said he, adding in that case Iran will have a chance to increase its influence there.

Epress.am

#### [OSCE Chair to ask Armenia, Azerbaijan to withdraw snipers from Line of Contact immediately](#) (ENG)

Addressing a UN Security Council meeting, the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office, Lithuanian Foreign Minister Audronius Azubalis, outlined the goals of the country’s 2011 OSCE Chairmanship and highlighted common challenges faced by the OSCE and UN. He also said that as the OSCE chairperson-in-office he will “invite the conflicting parties to implement confidence-building measures, including immediate withdrawal of snipers from the Line of Contact.

“I will invite the conflicting parties to implement confidence-building measures, including immediate withdrawal of snipers from the Line of Contact, and strengthening OSCE monitoring activities,” said he.

RFEL

#### [American-Armenians criticize Obama’s budget proposals](#) (ARM)

According to this article, the American-Armenians are discontent over US President Barack Obama’s decision to allot less aid in military and education programs to Armenia (\$3,450,000 million) compared to Azerbaijan (\$3,900,000 million). They are concerned that the misbalance in this aid can jeopardize the process of the settlement of the Karabakh conflict.

“The President’s proposal to break the balance of the military aid to Azerbaijan’s benefit may put threat to the process of the peaceful resolution of the Karabakh conflict,” the Executive Director of the Armenia National Committee of America Aram Hamparian said.

02.17.2011

Tert.am

#### [Azerbaijani troops launch subversive attack on contact line](#) (ENG)

According to the article, the Azerbaijani Armed Forces launched a subversive attack on the Line of Contact line between Nagorno Karabakh and Azerbaijan. The attack, which occurred at 8:30 pm on Friday in the north-eastern section of the line, saw a strong counteraction by the front troops of the Karabakhi army, and the attack group had to escape. The Azerbaijani soldiers who served in a special detachment have reportedly suffered losses. The Armenian troops did not have any losses.

02.18.2011

Lragir.am

#### [Issues related to the extension of the OSCE Minsk Group discussed](#) (ARM)

The article says that at a meeting with the US Secretary of State Hilary Clinton and senior members of the US administration in Helsinki, the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office, Lithuanian Foreign Minister Audronius Azubalis underlined Lithuania’s commitment to promoting OSCE principles, searching for resolution of the protracted conflicts in the OSCE area – including the Karabakh and the Transdnestrian conflicts – supporting freedom of the media, building and maintaining trust and confidence, and promoting energy

security. He also said that greater engagement by the Co-Chairs of the Minsk Group will also be required to reduce the growing tensions on the ground in and around Nagorno-Karabakh.

RFEL

[Aliyev: “We will be able to move forward, if the Armenian side understands that Karabakh’s independence is impossible” \(ARM\)](#)

The article says that Azerbaijani President Ilham Aliyev said in an interview with the Mir TV that no progress will be reached in the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, if unacceptable requirements are presented to Baku. “Azerbaijan’s territorial integrity, including Nagorno Karabakh, has been recognized by all the states and the international community ... If the Armenian side adopts a constructive approach, i.e. that the independence Nagorno Karabakh is impossible, then we will be able to move forward,” said Aliyev. The article also says that Deputy Armenian Foreign Minister Shavarsh Kocharyan said in an interview with the same TV on the same day, that Aliyev’s statements are aimed at failing the peace process and forging the essence of the issue.

Tert.am

[Armenian, Azerbaijani presidents to meet in Sochi in March \(ENG\)](#)

According to this article, the newly appointed US Ambassador to Azerbaijan, Matthew Bryza said that the next official meeting between the Armenian and Azerbaijani presidents will take place in the Russian town of Sochi on March 5. He also said that the meeting will also be attended by Russian President Dmitry Medvedev.

“We must use our best efforts to avoid the renewal of the war. We must take into consideration the adopted principles which include peaceful conflict settlement, territorial integrity and people’s right to self-determination,” he said.

[Nagorno Karabakh’s Foreign Ministry comments on ICG’s report on Karabakh conflict \(ENG\)](#)

The article says that the Foreign Ministry of the unrecognized Republic of Nagorno Karabakh has issued a statement, expressing concerns over the International Crisis Group’s recent report on Karabakh conflict. The ministry particularly said that by reading the report one automatically comes to the conclusion that it was written exclusively for convincing Armenia to ‘soften’ its positions on the negotiation process, particularly, the final status of Nagorno Karabakh.

“Another matter is the fairness of the report, which is written thousands of kilometres away from Nagorno Karabakh, and the authors of the document have never visited the country...,” read the statement.

News.am

[Some foreign offices view Nagorno-Karabakh as independent \(ENG\)](#)

The article says that on their official websites some foreign offices advise against visiting some regions of Armenia and Nagorno-Karabakh because of permanent shootings by the Azerbaijani side despite the international community’s pressure. It also says that the foreign offices of Hungary, Italy and Spain have had this information on their official websites for many years, while Azerbaijan has attempted to interpret it as its great diplomatic achievement. The article further comments that it is at least strange as many countries do not advise their citizens to visit certain places even in developed European countries.

RFEL [Bryza promises to make every effort to assist co-chairs](#)

The article says that the newly-appointed US Ambassador to Azerbaijan Mathew Bryza said at a briefing in Baku that he will do his best to assist the OSCE Minsk Group co-chairs.

“I will make every effort to assist Ambassador Robert Bradtke and the other Minsk Group co-chairs who are helping the parties to find a compromise, a fair and permanent to the conflict,” said he, adding that the settlement of the Karabakh conflict should be in line with the three main principles of the Helsinki Act.

02.19.2011

Tert.am

#### [Artsakh president and Armenian defense minister discussed military cooperation](#) (ENG)

The article says that Bako Sahakyan, the President of the unrecognized Republic of Karabakh, received Armenia's Defense Minister Seyran Ohanyan and his first deputy Davit Tonoyan. The parties discussed issues related to cooperation between Armenian and Artsakh in defense sector, as well as the situation on the Line of Contact between Artsakh and Azerbaijan.

News.am

#### [Nagorno-Karabakh conflict far from being “frozen”, Polish Ambassador says](#) (ENG)

According to this article, Polish Ambassador to Azerbaijan Mikhail Labenda said that war is unacceptable when it comes to the settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. “War is not a solution to the conflict. All ways except for peaceful resolution to the conflict should be ruled out. I hope the historical justice will be restored due to efforts of Armenia and Azerbaijan, international community and OSCE Minsk Group,” Labenda emphasized.

#### [Washington for Azerbaijan's territorial integrity](#) (ENG)

The newly-appointed US Ambassador to Azerbaijan Matthew Bryza said at a televised interview that the OSCE Minsk Group cannot decide instead of the parties to the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. According to him, official Washington is for Azerbaijan's territorial integrity. On his part, Ambassador Bryza is ready to contribute to a fair settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. However, he stressed that the Karabakh peace process is not the priority of his diplomatic mission.

02.21.2011

Tert.am

#### [Nagorno Karabakh Office in US criticizes book misrepresenting facts about Karabakh war](#) (ENG)

The article says that the Office of the unrecognized Republic of Nagorno Karabakh in US has released a statement voicing criticism over a book on the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict and by Heiko Krueger from Germany. The authors of the statement criticize the book which they say “misrepresents the well-documented facts as well as prejudiced reading of norms and principals of international law”. They also said that to the disappointment of the audience, Mr. Krueger's work appeared to be what they called “a rather primitive example of Azerbaijan's state propaganda targeting the Nagorno Karabakh Republic and Armenia”.

#### [Sub-committee on Nagorno Karabakh affairs is not a Turkish project – Chavushoglu](#)

The PACE sub-committee on Nagorno Karabakh affairs is not a Turkish project, said Mevlut Chavushoglu, the president of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE), adding that all allegations that the sub-committee is a Turkish project are untrue.

“The media and some of our partners in Armenia claim it is a Turkish project. I even announced in Yerevan that there was no need to cheat the Armenians. Why do they tell lies? If, instead of me, the committee president were an Armenian he'd have to bring the issue to the agenda because there was no other alternative. The sub-committee was set up based on objective criteria, in accordance with the Council of Europe's decisions and standards. And no Turkish national is involved in the process,” Chavushoglu said.

Lragir.am

**[Robert Avetisyan: “NKR is open for constructive dialogue with Azerbaijan”](#)** (ARM)

The article says that Robert Avetisyan, the permanent representative of the unrecognized Republic of Nagorno Karabakh in US, delivered a lecture over the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict at the Institute of Conflict Analysis and Resolution at Washington's George Mason University. Avetisyan said during the lecture that Karabakh is open for constructive dialogue with Azerbaijan, expressing hope that “Azerbaijani leadership will eventually adopt a constructive approach” over the conflict which make it possible to settle the issue.

News.am

**[The Director of US intelligence says Karabakh conflict potential flashpoint](#)** (ENG)

James Clapper, the Director of US National Intelligence said that the unresolved conflicts of the Caucasus and the fragility of some of the Central Asian states provide the most likely flashpoints in the Eurasia region. Clapper noted the frozen Nagorno-Karabakh conflict is also a potential flashpoint. “... Heightened rhetoric and distrust on both sides and violent incidents along the Line of Contact throughout last summer increase the risk that minor military exchanges could lead to miscalculations that could escalate the situation with little warning,” he said.

02.22.2010

Tert.am

**[Nagorno Karabakh should join peace talks – Dashnak member](#)** (ENG)

Nagorno Karabakh's recent activeness in the peaceful conflict settlement process is aimed at preventing a possible war, Kiro Manoyan, a senior Dashnaktsutyun party official said. “There is a very little likelihood of war, but even unpredicted developments may result in an armed conflict,” Kiro Manoyan told a news conference, calling on Armenia to take a “firm stance” and urge that Karabakh join the peace talks.

News.am

**[Website dedicated to Armenian community in Baku to be presented in Yerevan](#)** (ENG)

The article says that Armenian Genocide Museum-Institute has launched a website ([www.baku.am](http://www.baku.am)) dedicated to the Armenian community in Baku. The website, which will be introduced to the readership in Yerevan, presents a unique trilingual web resource, covering the social, political, cultural and business life of the Armenian community in Baku. Hundreds of photographs, illustrations and post cards demonstrate the history of Armenian families, Armenian buildings, and Armenian press issued in Baku, publishing, advertisements and generally the history of Armenian cultural existence in Baku.

**[International community for Stepanakert's direct involvement in peace process, Ohanyan says](#)** (ENG)

The Armenian side always raises the issue on Karabakh's direct involvement in the Karabakh peace process, Armenian Defense Minister Seyran Ohanyan said at a meeting at Yerevan State University,

adding that Karabakh joins the negotiations in the last stage of the peace process; the talks are likely to get a fresh start.

“Representatives of international organizations also stress the necessity for Karabakh’s full-fledged involvement in the negotiation process,” Ohanyan said.

#### [Political will lacking for settlement of Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, OSCE official says](#) (ENG)

The lack of progress on conflicts in the OSCE area at the Astana summit in December last year will be an extra stimulus to the active work of the Lithuanian chairmanship of the organization, Special Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office for Protracted Conflicts Giedrius Cekuolis said upon his visit to Baku.

“Political will is not enough, and we hope to wake up this will. The Minsk Group is capable of it,” he said. “My main goal during this visit is to attentively study the views of the parties, both in Baku and Yerevan. You [the conflicting parties] are the best experts in the glow conflict. Ways to resolve the conflict may be developed with the political will, your knowledge, and the help of the OSCE,” he added.

02.23.2011

Tert.am

#### [WikiLeaks: Azerbaijan cannot capture Karabakh](#) (ENG)

According to the article, former US Ambassador to Azerbaijan, Anne Derse said in a leaked US secret cable that “Azerbaijan, even with its focus on improving its military capability, is unlikely anytime soon to structure a force large or well-equipped enough to overcome the terrain advantages enjoyed by the NK Self-Defense Force and the Armenian army”. The cable, dated July 2, 2009, contains US diplomats’ comments on the Azerbaijani president’s rhetoric and their analysis on the country’s potentials to settle the conflict in Nagorno Karabakh.

RFEL

#### [Serzh Sargsyan discussed Karabakh conflict with US Deputy Secretary of State](#) (ARM)

The article says that US Deputy Secretary of State James Steinberg and US Assistant Secretary of State for European and Eurasian Affairs Philip Gordon were received by Armenia’s President Serzh Sargsyan and Foreign Minsiter Edward Nalbandyan and among other things, such regional security issues, discussed also the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. The two-high ranking US diplomats are expected to visit also the top leadership in Georgia and Azerbaijan.

02.24.2011

Tert.am

#### [Armenia should recognize legally that pogroms in Azerbaijan constituted Genocide – MP](#) (ENG)

According to this article, Larisa Alaverdyan of the opposition Armenian party Heritage said that pogroms against in Armenians in Azerbaijan “should be recognized as an act of Genocide under the Armenian legislation”.

“The present-day Azerbaijani leadership honours man-slayers as heroes. This is already a proof that the 1988 mass killings were dictated by the country’s state policy; they did not constitute violence perpetrated by some groups of drug addicts,” she said.

Lragir.am

### [Steinberg: There must be no doubt \(ENG\)](#)

According to the articles, the Deputy US Secretary of State James Steinberg said in Baku Washington is interested in the quickest resolution of the Karabakh conflict based on the international law and the Helsinki Principles. He also said that the US hopes that there will be certain progress in the settlement of the conflict.

“We hope for certain progress in resolving the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. We think that both countries are interested in promoting this issue. I plan to learn the opinion of Azerbaijani President Ilham Aliyev how we can move this process forward by common effort,” he said.

News.am

### [Azerbaijan’s military rhetoric undermines international norms \(ENG\)](#)

Former OSCE Minsk Group Co-Chair Vladimir Kazimirov said that Azerbaijan is unlikely to resume hostilities, while numerous statements of Azerbaijani politicians are mere military rhetoric and undermine international norms. He also said that there should not be any response to Azerbaijan’s military rhetoric.

“The world community led by the OSCE should decide on the issue, as numerous threats to resume war voiced by the Azerbaijani administration undermine international legal norms and hinder peaceful resolution of the conflict,” he said.

### [Resumption of hostilities cannot be ruled out, EU official says \(ENG\)](#)

The outgoing EU Special Envoy for the South Caucasus Peter Semneby said the EU will continue active participation in all the regional processes, including the settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh, which, he said is becoming more and more serious issue for the Union. He also said that the EU would devote more attention to the process and would seek ways to support the efforts of the OSCE Minsk Group. Semneby, however, stressed that one cannot rule out resumption of hostilities in the conflict zone.

RFEL

### [EU envoy warns of Karabakh escalation \(ENG\)](#)

EU Special Envoy to South Caucasus, Peter Semneby, according to this article, expressed concern at a discussion with Armenia’s President Serzh Sargsyan about an “intensifying arms race between Armenia and Azerbaijan” and warned that deadly skirmishes in the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict could escalate into more serious fighting.

“The ongoing arms race in the region can only have a destabilizing impact. This is something that we are seriously worried about. We have seen a lot of incidents over the course of last year ... I’m not talking about deliberate actions but we can not exclude that any of these incidents at some point escalates beyond control,” Semneby said.

02.25.2011

Lragir.am

### [Steinberg’s response \(ARM\)](#)

The article says that Deputy US Secretary of State James Steinberg said at a TV program in Armenia that wrong is the view that Russia has taken the upper hand over Europe and US when it comes to the mediating efforts over the settlement of the Karabakh conflict. Further, the article comments that by that statement Stenberg, in fact, hinted two things: first that there will be breakthrough at the trilateral meeting of

the Armenian, Azerbaijani and Russian presidents in Sochi on March 5, and secondly, that Steinberg's statement comes as response to a claim by Armenia's first president and oppositionist Levon Ter-Petrosyan, who said that the key to the Karabakh conflict is at the hand of Russia.

Hetq.am

#### [New concept offered over Karabakh issue](#) (ARM)

According to this article at a seminar-discussion titled "From the Artsakhi Kingdom to Republic" Andreas Ghukasyan, a specialist of international law, said that the defects of all the format of the settlement of the Karabakh conflict is that they all leave out the principle of human rights. In his opinion, Nagorno Karabakh can play a big role in changing this current peace process.

"If Artsakh waits in silence for Armenia and Azerbaijan to sign a document, then the situation may become irreversible, the NK's silence may be considered as a sign of consent," said he, adding that the Karabakh conflict needs a new concept.

RFEL

#### [Karabakhi politologist thinks selling of "Mi-35M" helicopters to Azerbaijan isn't message to Armenia](#) (ARM)

The articles says that Armenia's Defense Ministry still refrains from making any comments on a deal that saw the Russian company Rostvertol sell 24 "Mi-35M" fighting helicopters to Azerbaijan. It also says that David Babayan, the Spokesperson of the president of the unrecognized Republic of Nagorno Karabakh, said that the fact the news about this deal emerged on the day when the Armenian and Russian presidents met in Saint Petersburg on February 25 was just a coincidence, rather than a specific message addressed to Armenia.

News.am

#### [Lenin, Stalin cause of Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, Gorbachev says](#) (ENG)

Former USSR leader Mikhail Gorbachev said that Vladimir Lenin and Josef Stalin are the cause of Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. "Their policy of national-territorial division of the country was utterly wrong, which finally caused the USSR's collapse," Gorbachev said. Further, he justified his orders on introduction of troops to a number of regions with the tragedies in Fergana in 1989 and Baku in 1990. "The entire Caucasus – Armenia, Nagorno-Karabakh, Azerbaijan – was ablaze. Mechanism of seceding from the state was on there."

Epress.am

#### [NATO Pressures Azerbaijan through Karabakh: Analyst](#) (ENG)

According to the article, expert Mikhail Alexandrov said that standing behind Azerbaijan's latest threats to Nagorno-Karabakh is NATO, adding that threats by Azerbaijan are simply a way of pressuring Armenia. "Behind this is the West, particularly NATO ... There are double standards being used in resolving the Karabakh conflict and the conflict is taking too long," said he. Alexandrov also said that "the West's position on evidence of genocide on Armenians in Karabakh is incomprehensible". "It's unclear why Armenia's democratic regime is put on par with Nagorno-Karabakh's autocratic regime," he said.

02.26.2011

Tert.am

[US Armenians protest outside Azerbaijan's Consulate General in Los-Angeles](#) (ENG)

The article says that young American-Armenians gathered in protest outside Azerbaijan's Consulate General located in Los-Angeles in dedication to the 23rd anniversary of the pogroms against ethnic Armenians in Sumgait. Several hundred people attended the protest rally initiated by the "United Armenian Youth" organization. Further, it says that later the protestors were joined by foreigners in their criticism against the crime committed towards Armenians and in their demand for retribution.

[Karabakh independence doesn't violate Azerbaijan's territorial integrity](#) (ENG)

Representative of the unrecognized Republic of Nagorno Karabakh in US said at a lecture at the Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution of George Mason University and New York University that Karabakh is committed to finding a peaceful solution to the conflict and that Karabakh's recognition neither violates the territorial integrity of Azerbaijan, nor threatens its existence. He also said that Azerbaijan and Karabakh can be good neighbours.

"Karabakh and Azerbaijan can be good neighbours, but their coexistence in a common political-administrative entity is impossible," said Avetisyan, adding that the Nagorno-Karabakh Republic is open for a constructive dialogue with Azerbaijan.

News.am

[Too little progress observed in Karabakh conflict settlement within recent 5 years, EU envoy says](#) (ENG)

According to this article, EU outgoing Special Representative for the South Caucasus Peter Semneby said in Baku that "too little progress has been observed in resolving the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict over the last five year".

"Certainly, there were positive aspects, for example, intensifying the negotiation process in 2008 after the conflict in Georgia. The parties of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict recalled about the danger due to the unresolved status of the conflict. The situation with Nagorno-Karabakh conflict raises concerns because the conflict does not exist in a vacuum," Semneby told a press conference on February 26.

02.28.2011

Tert.am

[Negotiating parties should avoid applying Kosovo precedent to Karabakh – US ambassador](#) (ENG)

US Ambassador to Armenia Marie Yovanovitch said at a meeting at the Yerevan State University that any conflict is unique and has its specificities, responding to a question whether or not parallels can be drawn between the Nagorno Karabakh and Kosovo conflicts. "Kosovo is under the UN protectorate, but this is not the case with Nagorno Karabakh," she said, adding that each conflict and negotiation process has its specificities depending on the historical context. She also recommended the negotiating parties against fixing similarities between the two processes or applying the Kosovo precedent to Nagorno Karabakh.

[Epress.am Armenia Citizens Should Stop Serving in Nagorno-Karabakh: Human Rights Defender](#) (ENG)The article says that Mikayel Danielyan, the president of the Helsinki Association, said while presenting a report on the situation in the Armenian army that Armenia should stop sending its citizens as conscripts to the military units in Nagorno Karabakh. In Danielyan's opinion, it's easier to hide incidents of persecution of soldiers in Karabakh.

## Digest of Azerbaijani Media for Feb 15- 26, 2011

*By News Digest*

15.02.2011

TREND.az

[Separatist regime confirms fact of large- scale military exercises in Azerbaijan's occupied territories](#) [ENG]

The newspaper reports on the confirmation of large- scale military exercise carried out in the occupied Azerbaijani territories by the separatist regime of Nagorno- Karabakh. According to the reports, exercises would last till February 19<sup>th</sup>.

16.02.2011

DAY.az

[Azerbaijani political scientist on reality of an outbreak of war in Karabakh](#) [RUS]

Azerbaijan's political scientist, Fikret Sadikhov, confirmed predictions made by the International Crisis Group in its recent report evaluating the Karabakh conflict. Sadikhov noted, that perhaps finally European political scientists understand the reality of the conflict.

Judging the last 20 years of conflict, Sadikhov said Armenia doesn't want release the occupied territories while all international parties involved in the resolution of the conflict remain indifferent to the situation. Given such circumstances, Azerbaijan has no other choice.

17.02.2011

NEWS.az

[Armenian MFA accuses Azerbaijan](#) [ENG]

Recently, Azerbaijani President gave an interview to Russian's Mir Interstate TV and Radio Company, this interview and things Aliyev said there only thwart the negotiation process said Armenia's Deputy Foreign Minister Shavarsh Kocharyan.

Deputy referred to a document dating to September 1993 signed by the acting president Heydar Aliyev giving certain powers to Vice Chairman of the Supreme Council A. Jalilov. Based on these powers, Jalilova and the then foreign minister of Nagorno- Karabakh Republic Arkady Ghukazyan held talks. The paragraphs goes to outline the details of the talks and eventually led to Bishkek agreement signed in Moscow between Heydar Aliyev and Robert Kocharyan. This, said Shavarsh, means that Azerbaijan already recognized Nagorno- Karabakh Republic by simply getting involved in these talks.

Deputy foreign minister called on the Azerbaijani authorities to keep Nagorno Karabakh Republic in the loop of the negotiations.

19.02.2011

DAY.az

[Poland's ambassador: "War is not a solution for Karabakh conflict"](#) [RUS]

Poland's ambassador to Azerbaijan believes that resolution of the Karabakh conflict must be done by peaceful means only. In addition, the ambassador noted that this conflict should not be termed as frozen. Mikhail Labenda, also expressed his hope, that with joint efforts of Minks group, and the two sides of the conflict, solution satisfying both countries will be reached.

TREND.az

[Lack of progress on Nagorno- Karabakh remains biggest problem in S. Caucasus: Consul General](#) [ENG]

While speaking at the "U.S. strategy towards the South Caucasus and the Caspian Sea" conference, Azerbaijan's Consul General in L.A. Elin Suleymanov, noted importance of the Karabakh conflict and its further implications on the overall development of the region. While the two countries were close to reaching an agreement in 1999 in Istanbul, no concrete results were achieved. Eleven years later, meeting in Astana (2010) too could have led to certain solutions but once again the process failed. Consul General saw lack of common political will as the main obstacle to failing resolve the conflict.

21.02.2011

TREND.az

[OSCE to emphasize confidence- building measures between parties of Nagorno- Karabakh conflict](#) [ENG]

Confidence building measures are set as a priority for the Special Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office for Protracted Conflicts Giedrius Cekuolis. One of the first steps that must be taken emphasized Cekuolis is removal of snipers from the contact line. For trust, bloodshed must be prevented. He also stressed the fact that there can be no other solution but peaceful to Karabakh conflict.

22.02.2011

NEWS.az

[Russia may 'recognize Karabakh' if Azerbaijan, Turkey sign military deal](#) [ENG]

NEWS.az interviewed Andrei Rayevski, editor-in-chief of Russian news agency Mediafax. In his interview, Rayevski, spoke on the unsuccessful past 18 years of negotiations and inability to reach some common ground. He also pointed out to factors as none of the Minsk Group co-chairs- Russia, US or France, pressuring Armenia up to this day to liberate occupied territories, which is according to Rayevski is largely due to large Armenian Diaspora living in these countries. It is partially for this reason, that Azerbaijan should forget Russia pressuring Armenian or in fact any other country that is party of the Minsk group.

Rayevski also commented on the military capabilities of the two countries, saying Azerbaijan doesn't stand a chance against Armenia that is backed up by Russia, unless, Azerbaijan teams up with Turkey.

In the context of different players and different circumstances, Rayevski also noted that there is no guarantee for Russia not recognizing Nagorno Karabakh, especially after it recognized South Ossetia and Abkhazia.

23.02.2011

DAY.az

[Eynulla Madatli: "Baku can review its participation in talks on Karabakh"](#) [RUS]

Azerbaijan's Ambassador to Russia, Eynulla Madatli, said during an interview in Kiev that Azerbaijan can change its involvement in talks over Karabakh process if Armenia continues to prolong its decision making within the Madrid principles. Ambassador noted that currently official Baku is looking at a number of different variants to resolve the conflict and restore its territorial integrity. Madatli added that Azerbaijan would want that there was peace and that all three countries- Azerbaijan, Georgia, and Armenia lived in good neighborly relations.

#### [Russian expert estimates time frame for an outbreak of military actions in Karabakh](#) [RUS]

Aleksandr Skakov, Russian expert, believes changes for an outbreak of military actions in the Southern Caucasus is high especially if nothing is done by not only Russia, but also the West. Skakov, considers some kind of a harsh statement, or steps taken on behalf of the Minsk Group crucial. Because according to the expert, if nothing is done, then it is likely that closer to autumn of this year, possibility for war will be higher.

Expert also commented on the length of a military outbreak- ten days, two weeks at most. "No one would allow for more fighting. And in these two weeks, none of the sides will be able to get some kind of solution. What will follow afterwards, will be a number of harsh statements and steps, peacekeeping forces would be brought into the region and the situation will freeze".

#### [British expert: "the West is not paying its full attention to Karabakh conflict"](#) [RUS]

Given that Karabakh is small, and more pressing conflicts- Iraq, Iran, Afghanistan- the West is paying little attention to what is going on in Karabakh says British expert, James Nixi. According to the expert, while many experts believe that Karabakh is one of the most dangerous conflicts in the region, not much of attention is given to this conflict. Nixi also noted that the role of the Minsk Group is rather small, as he considers the decisiveness and understanding from the two sides to the conflict more crucial in this conflict than any role played by third parties. "For the conflict to resolve, the two countries must want to end the conflict, be more self critical and understand positions of each other" adding that "the West can only help".

24.02.2011

DAY.az

#### [Peter Semneby on progress in resolution of Karabakh conflict](#) [RUS]

Peter Semneby said he doesn't agree with a statement that no progress was achieved in the resolution of Karabakh conflict. "There is progress" he said "just not as serious as majority was expecting". However, he also added, that one, cannot rule out the possibility of a start of military actions. "I am not talking about planned actions, but we cannot rule out, that one of such incidents [referring to the shootings on the ceasefire line] could lead to an escalation of the situation" he said.

Semneby also noted that Karabakh is becoming a more serious topic for the European Union and that the Union will continue paying closer attention to this conflict and look for ways to support OSCE's Minsk Group in finding a way out.

#### [Azerbaijan's Ombudsman called on the international structures to apply sanctions against Armenia](#) [RUS]

In her remarks during commemoration of the genocide, Ombudsman Elmira Suleymanova, said no concrete measures were taken against terrorist acts committed by Armenia. Suleymanova added, that in a world when countries are working towards general peace, Armenian authorities, carrying out ethnic cleansing, terror and violence policies which negatively affect the overall peace-making processes in the Southern Caucasus and overall in Europe.

Ombudsman called on the international structures to apply sanctions against Armenia. The occupant country must leave the occupied territories and comply with international norms, said Suleymanova.

[Armenian expert: "Artificial quickening of Karabakh resolution can lead to war"](#) [RUS]

Head of the Analytical center on globalization and regional cooperation, Stepan Grigoryan believes that because the level of trust between the sides of the conflict is low any artificial speed up in talks, might lead to an outbreak of war. He reminded of the Georgia example.

In an article published on NEWS.az it appears that Grigoryan is highly skeptical of any peace agreement reached between the two countries as they stand too far from each other's principles. Grigoryan sees acceleration of Karabakh talks the result of uprisings taking place in the Arab world [[NEWS.az, Feb. 24, ENG](#)].

NEWS.az

[Karabakh conflict 'again becomes' actual for world community](#) [ENG]

Fikret Sadikhov, political scientist from Azerbaijan, appeared pessimistic while speaking on upcoming trilateral meeting between the presidents of Russia, Azerbaijan and Armenia in Sochi in March. Sadikhov underlined the reasons of growing interest on international level due to certain implications that would come with the outbreak of a war- from loss of control over the situation to missing out on controlling the negotiations and raising its role in the region.

It is because of recent tensions on the front line, that Karabakh became a pressing issue on international level said Sadikhov. Political scientist also stressed the importance Caspian hydrocarbon reserves carry for the West, in the aftermath of recent clashes and uprisings in the Middle East and North Africa.

Contrary to Sadikhov, head of the Noravank center Gagik Harutunyan, appears hopeful of the upcoming meeting in Sochi, as he believes the meeting should be focused on finding measures to defuse tension in the conflict zone. Harutunyan while saying that Karabakh conflict is potential flashpoint, was hoping that this status quo will change, given U.S. interests in soon resolution of the conflict [[NEWS.az, Feb. 23, ENG](#)].

[Damage to Armenia to be ten times higher than to Azerbaijan in case of war](#) [ENG]

Yashar Jafarli spoke to NEWS.az on the possible outbreak of war and the implications for both of the countries. Jafarli, who is military expert, said it won't be Armenia starting the war, but Azerbaijan. However, he noted, Azerbaijan won't initiate any military actions due to Russia's involvement in this conflict.

According to Jafarli, Armenia would 'collapse before the start of military actions' because of the country's inability to 'declare overall mobilization' not to mention, Armenia's absence of economic as well as human capital for raising military composition.

[Yerevan would be better advised to be further engage in the peace talks](#) [ENG]

Amanda Paul, Policy Analyst spoke with NEWS.az on Karabakh conflict and the role international players are playing in the settlement of the conflict. According to Paul, Southern Caucasus and its conflicts are not on the priority list of the U.S. politics as the country's foreign policy is more concerned with Iraq, Afghanistan, the Middle East and most recently North Africa. Russia on the other is the dominant actors, and the only actor in fact, carrying out the peace talks. However, what is not known is what's in it for Russia- surely it is aware that with a breakthrough in conflict it would lose influence over both countries.

Eventually, Paul said, Armenia will have to be honest and live up to the fact that it has occupied Azerbaijani territories and that these territories must be returned. However she noted, any peace deal, won't be signed in another 15 years, and so it is hard to say who will do what down the line.

25.02.2011

DAY.az

[Psychologist Asad Isazade: "Its not just Khodjali genocide resting on their conscience"](#) [RUS]

In his interview with Day.az, Isazade, pointed at the responsibility current President of Armenia Serj Sargsyan, and the Minister of Security Seyran Oganyan carried in the mass killings in February against peaceful residents of Khodjali. He noted that while Armenian soldiers who were there and committing those crimes, might feel the guilt, their leaders, namely the president and the minister and other commanders in charge, are living on their lives guilt free.

Isazade also noted that while a number of civil society activists and others apologized personally for the mass killings, they too were targets of criticism back in Armenia. And since, leaders' too depend on wider public opinion and support, they cannot take on a rhetoric that would damage their popularity.

[Russian political scientist talks about time frames of possible resumption of military actions for Karabakh](#) [RUS]

Andrey Areshev, editor-in-chief of an online community said that to name a time frame is not really correct as one needs to take into account a number of different factors- players outside of this region are not interested in having another war and are so much political and diplomatic work is carried out in maintaining the current status- quo. Not to mention, he added new proposals for the regulation of the conflict.

TREND.az

[State Department: U.S. official's visit to Azerbaijan, Armenian to defuse tensions in the region](#) [ENG]

Philip Crowley, U.S. State Department spokesman said U.S. administration wants the countries of the Southern Caucasus resolve tensions. While acknowledging certain stalls in the negotiation process, U.S. intends to actively engage with these countries, encouraging them to find alternative ways to settle certain issues. It is with this intention, that U.S. First Deputy Secretary of State James B. Steinberg is visiting Armenian and Azerbaijan- "to promote easing tensions in the region and settlement of Karabakh conflict".

During his visit [Feb. 23-24] together with U.S. Assistant Secretary for Europe and Eurasian Affairs Philip Gordon, the two representatives discussed Karabakh conflict noting "positive trends" and US intention to contribute to further developments in the negotiation process. Commenting on the activities of the Minsk Group, U.S. diplomat dismissed the argument that Russia assumed dominant role in this process. He noted that all Minsk Group co- chairs are working equally hard. U.S. representatives stressed that the only way to resolve this conflict is through peaceful means, which "is in the interests of all regional players [[TREND.az, Feb. 25, ENG](#)].

NEWS.az

[A narrow approach to self- determination would not have worked](#) [ENG]

News.az interviewed Dr. Sean Farren, politician from Northern Ireland on similarities and differences between Karabakh and N. Ireland conflict prior to his visit Baku. Farren, while talking about N. Ireland, said it was unfortunate that in this particular case, differences were pushed so far that conflict was inevitable resulting in suffering of communities, deaths, displacements and what not.

And while the two conflicts are different, Farren drew on parallels whereby the interests of all sides to the conflict were taken into account, which made the basis of the 1998 agreement that was complex in nature. He noted, that the people of Nagorno Karabakh should be present during the negotiation process especially when the discussion is on right to self- determination and every other agreement.

Farren also stressed that war won't solve anything and ultimately the two sides will have to sit down and come with another resolution. And the role of outside actors, could be influential especially in persuading the sides of the conflict to reach common ground.

26.02.2011

TREND.az

[Armenian Armed Forces break ceasefire](#) [ENG]

The online newspaper, reports on fire being opened from Armenia according to reports of Azerbaijan's Defense Ministry. No casualties were reported.

Similar report was made on February 24<sup>th</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup>, 21<sup>st</sup>, 18<sup>th</sup>, when Azerbaijan's Defense Ministry reported of other ceasefire violations. No casualties were reported [[TREND.az, Feb. 25, ENG](#); [TREND.az, Feb. 24, ENG](#); [TREND.az, Feb. 22, ENG](#); [TREND.az, Feb. 19, ENG](#)]

In another shooting on February 20<sup>th</sup> and one on February 17<sup>th</sup>, two Azerbaijani soldiers were wounded reports [TREND.az \[ENG\]](#) and [TREND.az \[ENG\]](#). An Azerbaijani soldier died in another shooting on [February 20<sup>th</sup>](#).

## ***About The Journal of Conflict Transformation***

The Journal of Conflict Transformation is an independent online publication that provides a forum for scholars, practitioners, policy analysts, starting researchers and bloggers to analyze as well as discuss the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict and issues related to it. The purpose of the publication is to contribute to sustainable resolution of the conflict by expanding scholarship on the subject and encouraging diverse perspectives and analysis.

The Journal welcomes contributions from established researchers and is also committed to include the voices of emerging analysts and writers within the peace process. This inter-disciplinary online publication accepts scholarly and analytical articles, as well as reflective writings, that contribute to the better understanding of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, Armenian-Azerbaijani relations and suggestions for improvement of the peace process and positive transformation of inter-societal relations. The articles can analyze the conflict as a whole or any factor that potentially has implication for the conflict and/or its resolution from the perspective of political science, economy, sociology, anthropology, social psychology, collective memory studies, comparative history, ethnic conflict, identity-conflict, conflict resolution, peace studies, mediation and facilitation, conflict transformation and comparative case studies.

The publication is supported by grants from the Democracy Commissions of the U.S. Embassy to Armenia and the U.S. Embassy to Azerbaijan and the Norwegian Atlantic Committee. Views expressed in the publication are those of its authors. The publication is established and managed by the Imagine Center for Conflict Transformation.

### ***Featured next on March 15:***

#### ***Analytical issue:***

PACE Subcommittee on  
Nagorno- Karabakh: An  
Opportunity for Multitrack  
Diplomacy

#### **By Afa Alizada**

A Question for the Field  
of Conflict Resolution:  
Who Decides the  
Outcome?

#### **By Tamar Palandjian**

Bi- weekly News Digest  
of Azerbaijan and  
Armenian media on  
Nagorno- Karabakh and  
Armenian- Azerbaijani  
relations

---

**We're on the Web!**

See us at:

<http://caucasusedition.net>

Follow us on:

[Facebook](#) and [Twitter](#)

If you wish to Unsubscribe, please email us at [editor@caucasusedition.net](mailto:editor@caucasusedition.net), and have 'unsubscribe' in the subject line.